Female Psychopathic Offenders: Personality Disorder and Offence Types

Dr Annette McKeown
Highly Specialist Forensic Psychologist
Tees Esk & Wear Valleys NHS Foundation Trust
Aims & Objectives

• Inform understanding of female psychopathic offenders.

• Present research findings on a prison-based study exploring psychopathy in female prisoners in a specialist personality disorder service.

• Compare psychopathy profiles to general female population and males in specialist personality disorder settings.

• Consider practical implications of findings to guide treatment provision.
In 1916, Marion Smith described in notes of Elmer Ernest Southard.

In 1939, David Henderson used terminology including “hypersexual” and “emotional instability”.

Emotional instability, promiscuity and suicidal behaviour referred to (Batchelor, 1954; Fremming, 1947; Greenacre, 1945).

Cleckley (1941) Mask of Sanity and female Case Studies Roberta & Anna (1941/1988)
Psychopathy Literature II

• Roberta's mother said "She has such sweet feelings," "but they don't amount to much. She's not hard or heartless, but she's all on the surface."

• Females described as “hypersexual” and “emotionally unstable” (Cleckley, 1941)

• In the 40s, test development began…

• Hare (1991) developed PCL-R

• In 2004, Comprehensive Assessment of Psychopathic Personality (CAPP) introduced
Psychopathy Literature III

- Cleckley (1941) and Karpman (1941, 1948) originally introduced the distinction between “primary psychopaths” and “secondary psychopaths”.

- Hicks et al. (2010) applied model to distinguish between primary psychopaths and secondary psychopaths in female offenders.

- Associations between Factor 1, Factor 2 and BPD (Blonigen, Sullivan, Hicks, & Patrick, 2012; Coid, 1993; Kruepke, 2015; Sprague et al., 2012).
Psychopathy & Personality Disorder Literature I

- Borderline personality disorder (BPD) characteristics associated with secondary psychopathy (Skeem, Johansson, Andershed, Kerr, & Louden, 2007; Falkenbach et al., 2017).

- It has been considered whether psychopathy in women is a manifestation of BPD (Sprague et al., 2012).

- Combination of Factor 1 and Factor 2 components of psychopathy explained suicidal ideation, self-harm and suicide attempts to a greater degree in women as opposed to men.
Psychopathy and Offence Types I

• Victims of violent women are more likely to be those known to them (e.g., Stewart, Gabora, Allegri, & Slavin-Stewart, 2014).

• Violent women who perpetrated aggression towards strangers and acquaintances, found to be more highly psychopathic (Weizmann-Henelius et al., 2003).

• Vitale et al. (2002) also found significant positive links between PCL-R scores and the number of violent offences committed by female offenders.
Psychopathy and Offence Types II

• In contrast, there are findings indicating little association between psychopathy levels and severe acts of violence (e.g. Adshead, 2016).

• Warren et al. (2005) found that females with a murder conviction scored significantly lower on the PCL-R compared to women without a murder conviction.

• Links between minor offences and psychopathy levels mirror the findings of Coid et al. (2009a), whose pooled results of male and female offenders found that psychopathy was associated only with theft as an offence type.
Klein Tuente, De Vogel and Stam (2014) examined a sample of 221 female forensic patients. 

- Lowered PCL-R score of 23 was applied (FAM; De Vogel et al., 2012).
- Found psychopathic women were younger at the age of their first conviction and more criminally versatile than non-psychopathic women.
- Findings indicated psychopathic women committed a fatal index offence less often than non-psychopathic females, and their victims were more often strangers.
- Important to note latter research sample forensic hospital patients, as opposed to women in prison.

Findings that female forensic patients present with differing offence characteristics than women in prison (Coid, Kahtan, Gault, & Jarman, 2000; Karsten, De Vogel, & Lancel, 2015).
Current Study
Current Study I

• Notable lack of research in specialist forensic settings in the UK exploring the prevalence of psychopathy.

• Lack of knowledge about the patterns of psychopathy, personality disorder and offending patterns in such populations.

• Current study will provide descriptive statistics on women assessed for the highest tier service within the OPD pathway for women in custody.

• No existing research with this population and this study will provide preliminary findings of a unique, high-risk, personality-disordered offender population.
Current Study II

Population:

- All women assessed by the service between 2006 and 2015 ($N = 45$) were invited to participate in the research study.
- Overall 30 women (66%) consented to engage in the broader research project.
- Of this sample, twenty eight women were assessed using PCL-R and were included in the current study.

Offence Types:

- 93% incarcerated for violent offence ($n = 26$)
- 7% incarcerated for sexual offences ($n = 2$)
Current Study III

- **Sentence Length**
  - 39.3% mandatory life sentence \((n = 11)\)
  - 46.4% indeterminate life sentence \((n = 13)\)
  - 14.3% fixed determinate sentence \((n = 4)\).

- **Measures:**
  - Demographic Information
  - Psychopathy Checklist - Revised (Hare, 2003)
  - International Personality Disorder Examination (IPDE; Loranger, 1999)
Current Study IV

- **Psychopathy (PCL-R Scores)**
  - Mean PCL-R score current sample $20.68$ ($SD = 5.52$)
  - Significantly higher than general sample of UK prisoners (Coid et al., 2009a)
  - Conversely significantly lower than sample of male offenders DSPD pilot (Kirkpatrick et al., 2010)
  - Large effect sizes

- **Psychopathy (PCL-R Scores)**
  - $32.1\%$ in the PCL-R 25 and above category ($n = 9$)
  - $42.9\%$ of women scored within the PCL-R 18-24 category ($n = 12$)
  - $25\%$ in the PCL-R below 18 category ($n = 7$)
Current Study V

PCL-R total and factor scores across populations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor 2</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primrose</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female US prisoners (Hare, 2003)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female UK prisoners (Coid et al., 2009a)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male DSPD (Kirkpatrick et al., 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Current Study VI

Offence Types: PCL-R Below 18

- Murder: 2
- Arson: 2
- Threats to Kill: 2
- Wounding: 1

Offence Type
Current Study VII

Offence Types: PCL-R 18 - 24

Frequency of offence types

- Murder: 3
- Wounding: 3
- Robbery: 2
- Child Cruelty: 2
- Sexual: 1
- Threats to Kill: 1

Offence Type
Current Study VIII

Offence Types: PCL-R 25+

Frequency of offence types:

- Murder: 4
- Manslaughter: 2
- Arson: 1
- Wounding: 1
- Sexual: 1

Offence Type
Current Study IX

Psychopathy (PCL-R Scores) & Offence Type

Fisher’s Exact Tests were performed to examine the relationship between the three PCL-R categories (i) PCL-R score below 18, (ii) PCL-R score 18-24; (iii) PCL-R score 25 + and offence type.

The offence types were categorised as: (i) sexual/child cruelty; (ii) murder/manslaughter; (iii) non-fatal violence and (iv) arson.

There were no significant associations found between the PCL-R categories and offence types, $X^2 (6, N = 27) = 9.21, p = .10, V = .43$.

Cramer’s V effect size moderate.
The most prevalent personality disorder diagnosis in the sample:
- BPD (85.1%) \( (n = 23) \)
- Antisocial personality disorder (ASPD) (51.8%) \( (n = 14) \),
- Narcissistic personality disorder (NPD) (11.1%) \( (n = 3) \)
- Paranoid personality disorder (PPD) (3.7%) \( (n = 1) \)
- Obsessive-compulsive personality disorder (OCPD) (3.7%) \( (n = 1) \),
- Histrionic personality disorder (HPD) (3.7%) \( (n = 1) \)
- Avoidant personality disorder (APD) (3.5%) \( (n = 1) \).

Fisher’s Exact Tests were also performed to examine the relationship between PCL-R categories and personality disorder.
Current Study XI

- Previously employed PCL-R categories were retained and due to the high prevalence of BPD, categories were devised to distinguish those (i) with a diagnosis of BPD and (ii) those without a BPD diagnosis.

- Significant associations were found between women with a diagnosis of BPD in the different PCL-R categories $X^2(2, N = 27) = 6.36, p = .01, V = .50$.

- Findings indicated that 100% of those in the 18 – 24 category were diagnosed with BPD as opposed to 50% of those in the below 18 PCL-R category.
Current Study XII

- Results also found that 78% of women who scored 25 or above were diagnosed with BPD.

- For women convicted of manslaughter or murder in this PCL-R category, the results indicated all women in this category with a diagnosis of BPD tended to kill intimates or family victims (100%).
Implications for practice

- When adopting the PCL-R cut-off score of 25, psychopathy prevalence rates of 32.1% in this specialist service for female personality disordered offenders.

- Indicates the importance of services for higher levels of psychopathy.

- Overall, findings suggest psychopathy, as measured by the PCL-R, to be somewhat muted in female prisoners in specialist personality disorder services in comparison to men.

- Use of other measures such as CAPP would be useful to explore...
Implications for Practice II

• High proportion of the PCL-R score of 25 or over category (66.7%) were incarcerated for the offences of either murder or manslaughter.

• It is somewhat in conflict with some findings, have suggested a lower prevalence of fatal index offences perpetrated by women with higher PCL-R scores (e.g., Klein Tuente et al., 2014).

• Further research with specialist female populations required and comparisons with general female forensic population.
Implications for Practice III

- The most prevalent category of PCL-R scores in this study was women scoring between 18 and 24. All women in the 18 to 24 category met the criteria for diagnosis of BPD.

- The prevalence of this category, along with its association to BPD, is consistent with the views that BPD may be a manifestation of psychopathy in females (Hicks et al., 2010; Sprague et al., 2012).

- This suggests the potential value of further exploring whether etiological pathways into BPD and psychopathy overlap, the nature of such overlaps, as well as potential differences.
Implications for Practice IV

- Potential clinical and theoretical implications warrant further exploration.

- For psychopathic women with BPD, it may be that emotional regulation and interpersonal difficulties key areas of treatment and BPD evidence-base treatment.

- It also may be that treatment interventions for psychopathic women with BPD may be less responsive for psychopathic women without this diagnosis.
Future Research

- Use of different measures of psychopathy (e.g. CAPP)

- Exploring different PCL-R cut-offs and categories and predictive value and whether distinguish between different types of violent female offenders.

- Exploring personality and psychopathy patterns across OPD pathway for women would be of value.

- Examining treatment responsivity also of great value.

- Comparisons to other population and sample size considerations.
Thank You
Any questions?

Annette.McKeown01@hmps.gsi.gov.uk
Annette.mcKeown@nhs.net